# Primitive Elements on Lines in Extensions

Stephen D Cohen

University of Glasgow

Fq9, Dublin, 15 July, 2009

Definitions 1  $\theta$  generates  $\mathbb{F}_{q^n}$  (over  $\mathbb{F}_q$ ) if  $\mathbb{F}_q(\theta) = \mathbb{F}_{q^n}$ 

 $heta_1, heta_2$  (non-zero) generate  $\mathbb{F}_{q^n}$  (over  $\mathbb{F}_q$ ) if  $\mathbb{F}_q( heta_1, heta_2) = \mathbb{F}_{q^n}$ 

A primitive element of  $\mathbb{F}_{q^n}$  is a generator of the cyclic multiplicative group of  $\mathbb{F}_{q^n}$ . It has order  $q^n - 1$ 

For any divisor k of  $q^n - 1$ , a k-free element  $\gamma$  of  $\mathbb{F}_{q^n}^*$  is such that  $\gamma = \beta^d \ (\beta \in \mathbb{F}_{q^n}, \ d | k)$  implies d = 1

• A primitive element of  $\mathbb{F}_{q^n}$  is  $(q^n - 1)$ -free

Q is the set of all prime powers

Note: where appropriate, take q odd in what follows!

## Translates problem

## Theorem (Davenport, 1937; Carlitz, 1953)

Suppose  $\theta$  generates  $\mathbb{F}_{q^n}$ . Then provided q is sufficiently large  $\exists a \in \mathbb{F}_q$  such that  $\theta + a$  is a primitive element of  $\mathbb{F}_{q^n}$ 

### **Translates problem**

Can we guarantee that  $\exists a \in \mathbb{F}_q$  such that  $\theta + a$  is a primitive element of  $\mathbb{F}_{q^n}$  for every generator  $\theta$  of  $\mathbb{F}_{q^n}$ ?

Refer to the "line"  $\{\theta + a : a \in \mathbb{F}_q\}$  as a "translate" of  $\mathbb{F}_q$ 

## Definition 2 $\mathcal{T}_n :=$ set of prime powers q such that, $\forall$ generators $\theta$ of $\mathbb{F}_{q^n}, \exists a \in \mathbb{F}_q$ such that $\theta + a$ is a primitive element of $\mathbb{F}_{q^n}$ = prime powers s. t. every translate contains a primitive element

▲御★ ▲注★ ▲注★

## Theorem (Davenport-Carlitz)

Given n, all sufficiently large q are in  $T_n \qquad Q \setminus T_n$  is finite

#### Line problem

Can we guarantee that  $\exists a \in \mathbb{F}_q$  such that  $\theta_1 + a\theta_2$  is a primitive element of  $\mathbb{F}_{q^n}$  whenever  $\theta_1, \theta_2$  generate  $\mathbb{F}_{q^n}$ ?

## Alternative form (used from now on)

Given that  $\alpha, \theta$  generate  $\mathbb{F}_{q^n}$ , can we guarantee that  $\exists a \in \mathbb{F}_q$  such that  $\alpha(\theta + a)$  is a primitive element of  $\mathbb{F}_{q^n}$ ?

• May be sensible even if  $\theta$  itself does not generate  $\mathbb{F}_{q^n}$ 

## Reduction of line problem

Suppose  $\mathbb{F}_q(\theta) = \mathbb{F}_{q^d}$  where  $d \mid n$  with d < nWrite

► 
$$Q_d = rac{q^n-1}{q^d-1}$$

•  $R_d$  = largest factor of  $q^d - 1$  with  $gcd(\frac{n}{d}, R_d) = 1$ 

Then

 $\alpha(\theta + a) \text{ is primitive } \iff \begin{cases} \alpha \text{ is } Q_d \text{-free and for some } \beta \in \mathbb{F}_{q^d} \\ \beta(\theta + a) \text{ is } R_d - \text{free in } \mathbb{F}_{q^d} \end{cases}$ 

Reduces this degree n line problem to one of degree d

Henceforth assume  $\theta$  is a generator of  $\mathbb{F}_{q^n}$ 

## Definition 3

 $\mathcal{L}_n :=$  set of prime powers q such that,  $\forall$  generators  $\theta$  of  $\mathbb{F}_{q^n}$  and  $\alpha \in \mathbb{F}_{q^n}^*, \exists a \in \mathbb{F}_q$  such that  $\alpha(\theta + a)$  is a primitive element of  $\mathbb{F}_{q^n}$ = prime powers s.t. all lines in  $\mathbb{F}_{q^n}$  contain a primitive element

### **Quadratic extensions**

Theorem 1 (Cohen, 1983)  $\mathcal{L}_2 = \mathcal{Q}$  "All lines in  $\mathbb{F}_{q^2}$  contain a primitive element"

- Method establishes numerical criteria to be satisfied for  $q \in Q$ 
  - ▶ for large q
  - for remaining q in a reasonable number of steps
  - ▶ no  $q \in \mathcal{Q}$  checked to be in  $\mathcal{L}_2$  by direct verification



#### **Cubic extensions**

Theorem (Mills and McNay, 2002 (presented at  $\mathbb{F}_q6$ , 2001)) Subject to the non-existence of prime powers q in certain ranges with  $18 \leq no$ . distinct primes in  $(q^3 - 1) \leq 24$ ,  $Q \setminus T_3$  is contained in a set of 429 prime powers (largest is 220411)

Theorem 2 (conjectured: M & M 2002; proved: SDC 2009)  $\mathcal{T}_3 = \mathcal{Q} \setminus \{3,7,9,13,37\}$ 

Theorem 3 (Cohen, 2009)  $\mathcal{Q} \setminus \mathcal{L}_3 \subseteq \{3, 4, 5, 7, 9, 11, 13, 31, 37\} \bigcup \mathcal{S}$ , where  $\mathcal{S}$  is a set of 175 prime powers, the largest being 9811

## Character sum expression

Let 
$$\alpha, \theta \in \mathbb{F}_{q^n}$$
:  $\alpha \neq 0$ ,  $\theta$  generates  $\mathbb{F}_{q^n}$   
For  $e|q^n - 1$ ,  
 $N(e) :=$  no. of *e*-free elements in  $\{\alpha(\theta + a), a \in \mathbb{F}_q\}$  (given line)  
 $N := N(q^n - 1) =$  number of primitive elements on line

Proposition 4  

$$N(e) = \rho(e) \left( q + \sum_{1 < d \mid e} \frac{\mu(d)}{\phi(d)} \sum_{(d)} \chi_d(\alpha) S_{\theta}(\chi_d) \right)$$

Here

• 
$$S_{\theta}(\chi) = \sum_{a \in \mathbb{F}_q} \chi(\theta + a), \quad \chi \text{ a multiplicative character of } \mathbb{F}_{q^n}$$

•  $\sum_{(d)}$  denotes a sum over all  $\phi(d)$  characters of  $\mathbb{F}_{q^n}$  of order d

▶  $\rho(e) = \frac{\phi(e)}{e}$  proportion of *e*-free elements in  $\mathbb{F}_{q^n}^*$ 

### Proposition 5 (Katz, 1989)

Suppose  $\theta$  generates  $\mathbb{F}_{q^n}$  and  $d \ (> 1)$  divides  $q^n - 1$ . Then

$$|S_{ heta}(\chi_d)| = \left|\sum_{m{a} \in \mathbb{F}_q} \chi_d( heta+m{a})
ight| \leq (n-1)\sqrt{q}$$

deep, in general

- relevance noticed by R Odoni, 1993
- easy in quadratic extensions (see later)

$$N(e) = \rho(e) \left( q + \sum_{1 < d \mid e} \frac{\mu(d)}{\phi(d)} \sum_{(d)} \chi_d(\alpha) S_\theta(\chi_d) \right), \ S_\theta(\chi_d) = \sum_{a \in \mathbb{F}_q} \chi_d(\theta + a)$$

Proposition 6 Suppose  $e|q^n - 1$ . Then for a given line  $\{\alpha(\theta + a) : a \in \mathbb{F}_q\}$  $N(e) > \rho(e)(q - (n - 1)2^{\omega(e)}\sqrt{q}); \quad \omega(e) = \#\{primes|e\}$ 

▶ ▲ 臣 ▶ ▲ 臣 ▶ ● 臣 ● の Q @

Take  $e = q^n - 1$  so that N(e) = NCorollary 7 Suppose  $q > (n - 1)^2 2^{2\omega(q^n - 1)}$ . Then  $q \in \mathcal{L}_n$ Corollary 8 (Davenport-Carlitz theorem) Given  $n, \exists q_0 = q_0(n)$  such that, if  $q > q_0$ , then  $q \in \mathcal{L}_n$ 

## Application to small degree extensions

Let  $\omega_n := \omega(q^n - 1)$ Quadratic:  $q > 2^{2\omega_2} \implies q \in \mathcal{L}_2$ Corollary 9 Suppose  $q \notin \mathcal{L}_2$ . Then  $\omega_2 < 14$  and  $q < 2.265 \times 10^8$ Proof. Assumes "worst case":  $q^2 - 1 = 8p_2 \cdots p_{\omega_2}$  (smallest primes) **Cubic:**  $q > 4 \cdot 2^{2\omega_3} \implies q \in \mathcal{L}_3$ Corollary 10 Suppose  $q \notin \mathcal{L}_3$ . Then  $\omega_3 \leq 52$  and  $q < 2.203 \times 10^{32}$ Quartic:  $q > 9 \cdot 2^{2\omega_4} \implies q \in \mathcal{L}_A$ Corollary 11 Suppose  $q \notin \mathcal{L}_4$ . Then  $\omega_4 \leq 154$  and  $q < 4.694 \times 10^{94}$ 

# $S_{\theta}(\chi_d)$ in quadratic extensions

Proposition 12 (Cohen, 1983)

Suppose n = 2 and  $\theta$  generates  $\mathbb{F}_{q^2}$ . Let  $d|q^2 - 1$ .

1. Assume d(>1)|q+1. Then  $S_{ heta}(\chi_d)=-1$ 

2. Assume  $d|q^2 - 1$ , but  $d \nmid q + 1$ . Then  $|S_{\theta}(\chi_d)| = \sqrt{q}$ 

### Proof.

Based on fact that  $\{1, \theta\}$  is a basis of  $\mathbb{F}_{q^2}/\mathbb{F}_q$ .

- ► For d|q+1, depends on  $\chi_d(\theta + a) = \chi_d(c(\theta + a)), \ c \in \mathbb{F}_q^*$
- ▶ Otherwise  $\{\frac{\theta+a}{\theta+b}; a, b \in \mathbb{F}_q\}$  is "most" of  $\mathbb{F}_{q^2}$

#### Corollary 13

Suppose e = f(q + 1), f (odd) with  $\omega(f) = t$ ,  $\omega(q + 1) = u$ . Then

$$\mathcal{N}(e) \geq 
ho(e)(q-(2^t-1)2^u\sqrt{q}-1)$$

Conjecture (Giudici, 1980 (extended)) All prime powers q are in  $\mathcal{L}_2$ 

Proposition 14 (Giudici and Margaglio, 1980) Suppose q is odd and

$$\phi(q+1) + 2\phi(q-1) > q-1.$$

Then  $q \in T_2$ 

• Proportion of prime powers q this criterion fails to show in  $T_2$ :

q <	10 <sup>5</sup>	10 <sup>6</sup>	10 <sup>7</sup>	10 <sup>8</sup>	10 <sup>9</sup>
% failures	14.983	15.176	15.081	15.065	15.066

$$\phi(q+1)+2\phi(q-1)>q-1\implies q\in\mathcal{L}_2$$

## Proof. Let $A := \{ \text{imprimitive } \theta + a \ (a \in \mathbb{F}_q) \text{ with primitive } \mathbb{F}_q \text{-norm} \}$ $= \{ (q+1) \text{-free } \theta + a \ (a \in \mathbb{F}_q) \text{ that are not primitive} \}$ Let $\operatorname{Nm}(A) := \text{set of } \mathbb{F}_q \text{-norms of } A$

Since  

$$\mathbb{F}_q^*\{(q+1)\text{-free } \theta + a\} = \{\text{all } (q+1)\text{-free members of } \mathbb{F}_{q^2}\}$$
  
then  $|A| = \phi(q+1) - N$ 

- $\blacktriangleright |A| \le 2|\mathrm{Nm}(A)|$
- ▶  $Nm(A) \subseteq$  non-squares of  $\mathbb{F}_q$  that are *not* primitive
- ▶  $|Nm(A)| \le \frac{1}{2}(q-1) \phi(q-1)$

Thus

$$N \ge \phi(q+1) + 2\phi(q-1) - (q-1)$$

・ロト ・四ト ・ヨト ・ヨトー

## Modified norm method for quadratic extensions

Let f be an odd divisor of q-1 with  $\omega(f) = t$ 

 $A := \{2f(q+1) \text{-free } \alpha(\theta + a) \text{ that are not primitive}\}.$ 

► 
$$|A| \ge \frac{\phi(f)}{f}(q+1-(2^t-1)2^{\omega(q+1)}\sqrt{q} -1) - N$$

▶  $Nm(A) \subseteq \{2f \text{-free elements of } \mathbb{F}_q \text{ that are not primitive}\}$ 

$$\blacktriangleright |\operatorname{Nm}(A)| = \frac{\phi(f)}{2f}(q-1) - \phi(q-1)$$

### Proposition 15 (Cohen 1983)

Suppose f is an odd divisor of q-1,  $t = \omega(f), u := \omega(q+1)$  and

$$rac{\phi(f)}{f}[\phi(q\!+\!1)(1\!-\!rac{(2^t-1)2^u\sqrt{q}}{q+1})\!-\!1]\!+\!2\phi(q\!-\!1)\!-\!rac{\phi(f)}{f}(q\!-\!1)>0$$

Then  $q \in \mathcal{L}_2$ 

## Application of modified norm criterion

▶ Take f to be the least odd prime in q - 1 (so  $t = \omega(f) = 1$ )

- shows q < 10<sup>7</sup> in L<sub>2</sub> except (possibly) for 139, 181, 1429, 680681, 1898051,...
   13 in all
- Proportion of prime powers this criterion fails to show in L<sub>2</sub>:

q <	10 <sup>5</sup>	10 <sup>6</sup>	10 <sup>7</sup>	10 <sup>8</sup>	10 <sup>9</sup>
# failures	3	4	13	101	812
% failures $\times 10^2$	3.09	0.508	0.195	0.175	0.156

- Take f to be the product of the least two primes in q-1
  - fails (only) for 139, 181, 1429  $(q < 10^9)$
  - $1429^2 1 = 2^3 \times 3 \times 5 \times 7 \times 11 \times 13 \times 17$

▶ Unable (provably) to identify L<sub>2</sub> by this approach !

## General prime sieve criterion (GPSC)

 $rad(q^n - 1) := radical of (product of distinct primes in) q^n - 1$  $rad(q^n - 1) := kp_1 \cdots p_s, p_1, \dots, p_s$  are distinct (sieving) primes k is core,  $t := \omega(k)$ 

Lemma 4  $N \ge \sum_{i=1}^{s} N(kp_i) - (s-1)N(k)$  $= \delta N(k) + \sum_{i=1}^{s} \left( N(kp_i) - \left(1 - \frac{1}{p_i}\right) N(k) \right),$ 

where 
$$\delta := 1 - \sum_{i=1}^{s} \frac{1}{p_i}$$

• Must have  $\delta > 0 \dots$ 

... so incorporate small primes in  $q^n - 1$  into k

□ ▶ ▲ 臣 ▶ ▲ 臣 ▶ ○ 臣 ○ の Q ()

$$\operatorname{rad}(q^n-1) = kp_1 \cdots p_s, \qquad \delta = 1 - \sum_{i=1}^s \frac{1}{p_i}$$
 $N \ge \delta N(k) + \sum_{i=1}^s \left( N(kp_i) - \left(1 - \frac{1}{p_i}\right) N(k) \right)$ 

$$\mathsf{N}(k) > \rho(k)(q - (n - 1)2^t \sqrt{q}) \quad (t = \omega(k))$$
  
$$\mathsf{N}(kp_i) - \left(1 - \frac{1}{p_i}\right) \mathsf{N}(k)| \le (n - 1)(s - 1 + \delta)2^t \sqrt{q}$$

## Proposition 16 (GPSC) Suppose $\delta > 0$ and

$$q > (n-1)^2 2^{2t} \left(\frac{s-1}{\delta} + 2\right)^2 := R_G$$

Then  $q \in \mathcal{L}_n$ 

# Prime sieve criterion for quadratic extensions (QPSC)

Uses  $S_{ heta}(\chi_d) = -1$  for d|q+1

Proposition 17 (QPSC)

Assume all primes in the core k divide q + 1. Suppose  $\delta > 0$  and

$$q > 2^{2t} \left(\frac{s_0 - 1}{\delta} + \frac{\delta_0}{\delta}\right)^2 := R_Q$$
  
•  $t = \omega(k), \qquad \delta = 1 - \sum_{i=1}^s \frac{1}{p_i} \text{ as before}$ 

•  $p_1, \ldots, p_{s_0}$  are primes dividing q-1

• 
$$\delta_0 = 1 - \sum_{i=1}^{s_0} \frac{1}{p_i}$$

Then  $q \in T_2$ . If  $q > R_Q^+$  (>  $R_Q$ ), then  $q \in \mathcal{L}_2$ 

Use QPSC for specific q but GPSC for ranges of q

 $\begin{array}{l} \underline{q = 169 = 13^2} \\ \blacktriangleright \ q - 1 = 2^3 \times 3 \times 7; \quad q + 1 = 2 \times 5 \times 17: \quad \text{take } t = 1; \\ \blacktriangleright \ \delta = 1 - \frac{1}{3} - \frac{1}{5} - \frac{1}{7} - \frac{1}{17} = 0.26498; \ \delta_0 = 1 - \frac{1}{3} - \frac{1}{7} = 0.52380 \\ \blacktriangleright \ R_Q < 133 \ < R_Q^+ < 137 \ < q = 169 \end{array}$ 

$$\begin{array}{l} \underline{q = 181} \\ \blacktriangleright \ q - 1 = 2^2 \times 3^2 \times 5; \quad q + 1 = 2 \times 7 \times 13: \quad t = 1; \\ \blacktriangleright \ \delta = 1 - \frac{1}{3} - \frac{1}{5} - \frac{1}{7} - \frac{1}{13} = 0.24688; \ \delta_0 = 0.46666 \\ \blacktriangleright \ R_Q < 142 \ < R_Q^+ < 146 \ < q = 181 \end{array}$$

#### q = 1429

- ▶  $q-1 = 2^2 \times 3 \times 7 \times 17$ ;  $q+1 = 2 \times 5 \times 11 \times 13$ : t = 2;
- $\delta = 0.29715; \ \delta_0 = 0.60784$
- $\blacktriangleright \ R_Q < 1233 \ < R_Q^+ < 1244 \ < q = 1429$

# Proof of Theorem 1: $\mathcal{L}_2 = \mathcal{Q}$

first step (following Corollary 9)  $\omega_2 = \omega(q^2 - 1)$ 

- ▶ can assume  $\omega_2 \le 14$  (and  $q < 2.265 imes 10^8$ )
- ▶ take k to be product of 3 least primes in q + 1: so t = 3

► 
$$s \le \omega_2 - 3 \le 11$$
:  $\delta \ge 1 - \frac{1}{7} - \frac{1}{11} - \dots - \frac{1}{43} > 0.39296$ 

$$\blacktriangleright$$
 so if  $q>48215>R_G$  then  $q\in\mathcal{L}_2$ 

▶ can assume q < 48215 and hence  $\omega_2 \leq 9$ 

 $\begin{array}{lll} \underline{\operatorname{second step}} & \omega_2 \leq 9 \\ \underline{\operatorname{third step}} & \omega_2 \leq 8 \\ \hline \underline{\operatorname{fourth step}} & \\ & \mathsf{assume } \omega_2 \leq 7 \text{ and } q < 22652 \\ & \mathsf{b} \text{ take } t = 2 \\ & \mathsf{b} s \leq \omega_2 - 2 \leq 5 : \quad \delta \geq 1 - \frac{1}{5} - \frac{1}{7} - \dots - \frac{1}{17} > 0.43048 \\ & \mathsf{b} \text{ so if } q > 2040 > R_G \text{ then } q \in \mathcal{L}_2 \end{array}$ 

▶ can assume q < 2040 and hence  $\omega_2 \leq 7$ 

#### fifth step Use QPSC

- ▶ assume  $\omega_2 = 7$  and q < 2040 (e.g., q = 1429)
- must have:  $\omega(q-1) = \omega(q+1) = 3$ ; 3 or 5 divides q+1
- ► *t* = 2

further steps

- ▶ for  $\omega_2 = 6$  similar argument gives  $q > 914 \implies q \in \mathcal{L}_2$ , etc
- ▶ Norm method covers small failures of QPSC (e.g. q = 211)

## Towards proof of Theorem 3: identifying $\mathcal{L}_3$

prime sieve criterion:

$$q > 4 imes 2^{2t} \left( rac{s-1}{\delta} + 2 
ight)^2 := R_G \implies q \in \mathcal{L}_3$$

first step (after Cor 9)  $\omega_3 = \omega(q^3 - 1)$ 

▶ assume  $20 \le \omega_3 \le 52$ ;  $8.232 \times 10^8 < q < 2.2029 \times 10^{32}$ 

▶ 
$$t = \omega(k) = 4$$
;  $s \le \omega_3 - 4 \le 48$ ;  $\delta > 0.20068$ 

• 
$$q \in \mathcal{L}_3$$
 since  $q > 5.7 \times 10^7 > R_G$ 

second step

 $\blacktriangleright$  assume 15  ${\leq}\omega_3 {\leq}$  19 and q > 850352 :  $$R_G < 672475$$  third step

▶ assume  $\omega_3 = 14$  and q > 235631 :  $R_G < 193864$ 

#### next steps

- ▶ assume  $\omega_3 = 13$  and q > 67257 :  $R_G < 142863$
- there are no prime powers q with 67257 < q < 142863
- similarly for  $10 \le \omega_3 \le 12$

▶  $\omega_3 \leq 9$  GPSC yields upper bounds for  $q \notin \mathcal{L}_3$ 

$\omega_3$	9	8	7	6	5	4	3	2
q <	25456	14849	8160	4131	1958	793	256	64

## Modified prime sieve criterion (MPSC)

Write: 
$$rad(q^n - 1) = kp_1 \cdots p_s/$$
 where  
 $k = core, p_1, \dots, p_s, l$  distinct primes (with  $l$  largest)  
 $t = \omega(k), \quad \delta = 1 - \sum_{i=1}^s \frac{1}{p_i}$ 

Proposition 18 (MPSC)

$$\begin{array}{ll} \textit{If} \quad q > R_M := (n-1)^2 \left\{ \frac{2^t \phi(k)(s-1+2\delta) + (1-\frac{1}{l})}{\phi(k)\delta - \frac{1}{l}} - 1 \right\}^2 \\ \textit{then } q \in \mathcal{L}_n \end{array}$$

Proof. 
$$N \geq N(kp_1 \cdots p_s) + N(l) - N(1)$$

and use GPSC (proof) for  $N(kp_1 \cdots p_s)$ 

Example (n = 3) q = 1759:  $R_M < 1619 < q < R_G = 1782$ 

#### Theorem

The complement of  $\mathcal{L}_3 \subseteq \{3, 4, 5, 7, 9, 11, 13, 31, 37\} \bigcup S$ , where S is a set of 175 prime powers, the largest being 9811

### Proof.

Identify  $q \in \mathcal{Q}$  within admissible ranges for  $q 
ot\in \mathcal{L}_3$  and use MPSC

### Conjecture

$$\mathcal{L}_3 = \mathcal{Q} \setminus \{3, 4, 5, 7, 9, 11, 13, 31, 37\}$$

- ▶ verified using MAGMA for prime powers  $q \le 100$
- ▶  $q = 97~(\in \mathcal{S})$  took 84 hours
- ▶ to extend search to identify L<sub>3</sub> would require q<sup>5</sup> searches for each prime power q (largest being ~ 10,000)

# Proof of Theorem 2: $T_3 = Q \setminus \{3, 7, 9, 13, 37\}$

- for each possible "failure" (~ 180 fields) identify one member of {θ + a : a ∈ F<sub>q</sub>} e.g., for q = p > 3, can assume Tr(θ) = 0
- use MAGMA to search for a primitive  $\theta + a$  ( $\sim q^2$  searches)
- successful except for  $q \in \{3, 4, 5, 7, 9, 11, 13, 31, 37\}$
- ▶ for q = p, maximum distance from an element  $\theta$  with  $Tr(\theta) = 0$  to a primitive element is 79 when q = 2731

From Corollary 11

$$q 
ot\in \mathcal{L}_4 \implies q < 4.694 imes 10^{94}$$
 and  $\omega_4 \le 154$ 

Using the GPSC obtain:

Theorem 19

$$q 
ot\in \mathcal{L}_4 \implies q \le 25943$$
 and  $\omega_4 \le 12$ 

### Conjecture

 $\mathcal{L}_4 = \mathcal{Q} \backslash \{2, 3, 4, 5, 7, 8, 9, 11, 13, 17, 19, 23, 25, 27, 29, 31, 32, 41, 43, 64\}$ 

#### 1 Davenport

On primitive roots in finite fields Quart. J. Math. Oxford, 8 (1937), 308–312



#### L Carlitz

Distribution of primitive roots in a finite field *Quart. J. Math. Oxford*, (2) 4 (**1953**), 4–10



#### R E Giudici & C Margaglio

A geometric characterization of the generators in a quadratic extension ... Rend. Sem. Mat. Univ. Padova, 62,(**1980**), 103–114

-∢ ≣ ≯

#### S D Cohen

Primitive roots in the quadratic extension of a finite field J. London Math Soc., (2) 27 (1983), 221–228

#### N M Katz

An estimate for character sums J. Amer. Math. Soc., 27 (1989), 197–200



#### D Mills & G McNay

Primitive roots in cubic extensions of finite fields  $\mathbb{F}_{q6}$  Proceedings (Oaxaca, 2001), Springer, 239-250, 2002



#### S D Cohen

Generators of the cubic extension of a finite field

J. Comb. Number Th., to appear 2009